

**BEFORE THE INVERCARGILL CITY COUNCIL**

**IN THE MATTER OF** the Resource Management Act 1991

**AND** an application to the Invercargill City Council by HWCP Management Ltd for resource consent to demolish, alter and redevelop land and buildings in the Central Business District on a block bound by the east side of Dee Street, the south side of Esk Street, the west side of Kelvin Street and the north side of Tay Street

---

**STATEMENT OF EVIDENCE OF JAMES CHARLES BURGESS  
ON BEHALF OF HWCP MANAGEMENT LTD**

**ARCHITECTURE & URBAN DESIGN**

**11 March 2019**

---

**INTRODUCTION**

1. My full name is James Charles Burgess. I am a Senior Associate Architect practising with The Buchan Group New Zealand PTY Ltd. (Buchan) in Christchurch where I lead the Design Studio.
2. Buchan is a global architectural group recognised for its design excellence and depth of experience within commercial, retail and complex mixed use developments. Internationally we are acknowledged as Retail and Town Centre Design Experts.
3. I hold a Bachelor of Architecture (Hons) from the University of Victoria, Wellington (2004). I am a full member of the NZIA 18883 and NZARB (no. 3728), first registering as an architect in New Zealand in 2008.
4. I have 15 years of experience within the architectural profession and presently work for Buchan in the role of Senior Associate, and have prior experience working in the United Kingdom for 6 years. Over the course of my career I have had particular experience and expertise within the assembly of complex mixed use developments comprising civic, retail, apartment and hotel usage in the Chadstone Shopping Centre in Melbourne.
5. Buchan's specific experience relevant to this evidence includes:
  - a) 34 years of renovation and development of the Chadstone Shopping Centre (213,000sqm) in Melbourne, including the delivery of the 7,000sqm gridshell roof; and
  - b) the design of the Eastland Shopping Centre in Melbourne (130,000sqm) and the creation of a town square alongside the centre which welcomes visitors through quality retailing, al fresco dining and generous public spaces for a mix of activities; and
  - c) the Robina Town Centre & Market Hall Redevelopment in the Gold Coast (138,000sqm), ongoing since 2008. The master plan created the opportunity for a number of major projects over the last decade. Today the centre incorporates new malls, the refurbishment of major and specialty tenancies, the realignment of the existing malls and new car parking; and
  - d) the Emporium in Melbourne (48,000sqm). Buchan's inspired response created a 'uniquely Melbourne' \$1.2 billion centre to complement Melbourne's famous

network of laneways by connecting five major city retail spaces in a network of shops under one roof; and

- e) the Sylvia Park Expansion in Auckland (18,000sqm). The architectural vision for Sylvia Park is to create a world class town centre and attract international brands; and
- f) the Brickworks at Lynn Mall in Auckland. The Brickworks is an award winning, tree-lined dining and entertainment precinct that is in direct contrast to the neighbouring homogenous internalised shopping centre; and
- g) Wintergarden in Brisbane. Wintergarden is the lifestyle hub at the heart of the Brisbane CBD, where prestigious brands and a range of experiences inspire people to shop and live; and
- h) the Grand Central Redevelopment in Toowoomba. Buchan's masterplan for Grand Central embodies sound retail planning principles, placement of major tenants, clear pedestrian access, car parking and goods and servicing provisions; and
- i) within the last two years the Christchurch studio has worked on The Hub Hornby, Coastlands Shopping Town, Bayhill Apartments in Timaru, Northlands Shopping Centre in Christchurch and The Landing in Wigram.

#### **CODE OF CONDUCT FOR EXPERT WITNESSES**

- 6. I have read the Code of Conduct for Expert Witnesses contained in the Environment Court Practice Note 2014. I have complied with it in preparing this evidence and I agree to comply with it in presenting evidence at this hearing. The evidence that I give is within my area of expertise except where I state that my evidence is given in reliance on another person's evidence. I have considered all material facts that are known to me that might alter or detract from the opinions that I express in this evidence.

#### **SCOPE OF EVIDENCE**

- 7. My evidence will cover:
  - a) the architectural and urban design principles, design process and assessment of effects of the proposed Invercargill Central development;
  - b) a commentary on the philosophy of heritage strategies undertaken within the design process;

- c) a commentary on responses received from submitters.
8. I confirm that I have read and am familiar with the submissions, Officer's Report and any proposed consent conditions.
9. I confirm that I have carried out numerous site visits (more than 10) since being commissioned in November 2017 by HWCP to carry out the design and masterplan for this development.
10. My evidence should be read together with the Buchan Invercargill Central / Resource Consent Amendment Design Statement dated 29 January 2019, which has been submitted to the Invercargill City Council.

### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

11. Invercargill Central is intended to create place. It will be a heart for the CBD, a multi-threaded mixed use development driving people into the CBD of Invercargill through the day and providing an important destination at night.
12. The functions proposed; entertainment, civic and workplace, health and wellbeing as well as complementary retail and food offers have been assembled to create a destination for the people of Invercargill to work, live and play.
13. It will be a destination with an extended trading period to attract people to the city after work to shop, have dinner or be entertained within a safe, comfortable space with a dynamic heart.
14. Invercargill Central is not just about the CBD block that it inhabits, it is about activating the wider CBD district through activated street edges, strengthened pedestrian routes, by driving footfall along Esk Street and reimagining and recreating north to south mid-block link connections while retaining the unique Invercargill street edge character and grain.
15. While the loss of any heritage fabric is saddening the assembly of this site into a significant development site has enabled development of a central business destination. In my opinion the quality of replacement will be an unquestionable improvement to the existing condition of the block, or of any adaptive reuse option proposed.
16. Invercargill Central responds to the urban grain of Invercargill city, engages with the public and contains a proposed mix of uses which will invite daily use of a wide cross section of the Invercargill public to create a true multi-threaded destination, much needed in Invercargill.

**URBAN DESIGN**

17. The overall masterplan has been developed around the following key philosophies:
  - a) Activating the street edge
  - b) Provision of a gateway entrance
  - c) Strengthening of existing pedestrian routes
  - d) The creation of a central weather protected piazza
  - e) A clear phasing strategy operation and delivery
  - f) Respect of the existing urban grain and facade ordering
  - g) Respect of existing heritage and build edge datums
  - h) Respect of canopy heights and the street edge
18. The Invercargill Central development site is bounded by the CBD streets of Esk, Dee, Tay and Kelvin. The site is assembled from multiple existing parcels of land comprising a total development footprint of approximately 19,365sqm.
19. Whilst there is some commercial activity upon the first floor of the block most buildings remain vacant, either awaiting tenants or being unfit for habitation for sanitary or structural reasons.
20. The larger multi-storey buildings upon the site have remained vacant for several years, for example the Newburgh Building has remained untenanted continuously for 35 years.
21. Most landholdings are typically around 20m in frontage with a variety of smaller frontage holdings across Tay Street. This typical landholding breakdown forms a recognisable grain of development and beat to the urban fabric surrounding the block.
22. Esk Street remains a vibrancy of activity and invites the gathering of people as the city centre of Invercargill. This is driven in part by its proximity to the SIT facility upon the north edge of Esk Street as well as a lack of other civic space or destination within the central business district environ.

23. Through a retailers lens the CBD has suffered from retail flight to surrounding large format offers. Over time the allowance of this flight has resulted in the CBD becoming a weaker proposition for retail, office or other activities and thus weakened retail driven footfall across Esk Street.
24. New development has recently been completed upon Don Street opposite the SIT arcade exit providing quality office accommodation and food offers. This has strengthened the north to south axis arcades as strong pedestrian links between Tay and Don Streets provide a mid-block connection as well as a weather respite. In addition, the Invercargill Licensing Trust has proposed further hotel development on Don Street with associated food offers connecting to the SIT arcade.
25. Tay and Dee Street are the primary traffic circulation corridors through the city being the junction of State Highway 1 and the terminus of State Highway 6. As such, both edges have wide road corridor widths and are more prone to traffic noise and air pollution.
26. The road corridor of both of these edges is wide at 40m from property boundary to property boundary allowing for four lanes of traffic as well as perpendicular parking. Edges at the southern and western sides of the development suffer from exposure to the westerly wind.
27. Esk Street is the predominant shopping and pedestrian environment street. It is distinctly more walkable with a property boundary to property boundary section width of 20m. The street is one way (running west to east). This edge has had significant public realm improvements as a result of the recommendations within the 2013 Invercargill Inner City Revitalisation Masterplan Report. Most notable of these improvements included the 'pocket park' centrally located adjacent to the Cambridge Arcade entrance.
28. Kelvin Street is a vehicle-friendly two-way road providing continuous connection from Tweed Street to the south and the north of Queens Park to the north. For this development Kelvin Street functions largely as a drop-off lane to either the Kelvin Hotel or to the H&J Smith Department Store.
29. The landholdings not under the control of the client group were Reading Cinema on Dee Street and the Kelvin Hotel on the east. These formed strong ordering principles for the balance of the site for alternative use leaving the opportunity to create a development of significance anchored at one end by the lifestyle centre of Reading Cinema and upon the east by multi-level accommodation.

30. Of particular note is the significant and consistent westerly wind. This is consistent annually with a strengthening in spring and summer. This wind makes the north/south and east/west roading arrangement particularly uncomfortable for the pedestrian as the wind tends to tunnel down the long Esk Street edge.

## USAGE

31. In assembling the site a dialogue about end user desires and needs was entered into which formed the key requirements of the brief to the Design Team. The fundamental aim of the development is to reimagine and revitalise the central business district. To achieve this the Design Team needed to create a place for people and reasons for coming to the CBD, not only for shopping and a variety of offers but for work, good quality food options, health and wellbeing and civic functions. It required multiple threads of activities to pull people through the development at a variety of times throughout the day and week.
32. Overlaid upon this is the need to make the CBD compete with the accessibility of large format retail centres around the perimeter of the Invercargill CBD. To do this the development brief was to provide a clear and accessible access strategy to car parking with more than adequate provisions.
33. Prior to a full commencement of masterplanning and ordering; three separate investigations were carried out by the design team:
- a) a Heritage Assessment of the existing building stock upon the site;
  - b) a detailed seismic assessment carried out to all existing buildings upon the site under the ownership of the client. This informed decisions around safety and possible retention strategies available to each of the development site; and
  - c) the commissioning of a point cloud modelling of the full CBD block bounded by Kelvin, Tay, Dee and Esk Streets. This point cloud allowed for highly accurate data to be extrapolated for all heritage assets – identifying datum and height points accurately.
34. At the heart of the proposal is the intention to create a place for people and the overall ordering of the development responds to this. To the west is the 'working' edge; the seven storey office accommodation on the Dee and Esk Street corner and the Civic Precinct on the Dee and Tay Street corner.

35. Adjacent to the office accommodation a large food and beverage precinct is proposed, formed as a series of offers. Directly above, a dining deck over looks Esk Street with vertical movement promoted through clearly visual staircases visible from Esk Street. A fashion and general retail mall connects running in a north to south axis. This is located on Esk Street in a similar location to that of the Cambridge Arcade, but offset upon the southern aspect. The offset is purposeful to create a sense of destination within the centre of the mall.
36. A large department store over two levels connects to the retail element. Adjacent to the Civic building a medical centre is proposed; a four storey development. Both the medical centre and Civic buildings are proposed to be entered from level 01 from a large north facing sheltered piazza space protected from the westerly wind and providing calm outdoor space. Car parking is accessed from Tay Street with a single ramp taking vehicles to level 01 where access can be found to the development via escalator, stair, lift or through the department store.
37. The food precinct is aligned to the lane entrance to 51 Esk Street, which is an existing route to car parking behind. Cambridge Arcade is replaced with New Cambridge, the proposed fashion mall. Through New Cambridge the food precinct and fashion mall connect at an activation node space within the centre of the development, which has a large central light well inviting pedestrians to a central destination. This then connects to a general retail mall leading to Tay Street. Tay Street has a slightly larger tenancy size catering to larger format general traders, but in itself is fully activated with shop fronts and activity.
38. The Civic south west corner on Tay and Dee Streets is particularly exposed to the weather. No amount of built edge conditions will turn the Tay and Dee Streets pedestrian footpath into a great public space condition. As such alternative strategies were explored to create space for people in this precinct of development.
39. Framing the Bank of New South Wales an office development is proposed along with a medical centre upon the Tay Street edge. By providing a pedestrian piazza above a ground level loading/service zone, the first floor becomes a piazza space directly connected to car parking and the office and medical functions.
40. The western wind is protected through the office building and allows for a first floor north facing aspect. This space is not demised ownership to a particular tenant and thus becomes a place for people to gather and connect externally.
41. Through design development; it was determined by the Design Team to be more appropriate to centralise the massing upon Tay Street and limit building over the eastern anchor retailer. This will relieve the façade wall length resulting in a marginal increase of one floor (3.1m) to



the centre of the development. This massing has resulted in a slightly reduced car park count from circa 950 parks to circa 850 parks.

42. In addition to the car park adjustment, market and tenant interest has resulted in the increase in mass of the Civic Precinct in the south east of the development framing the Bank of New South Wales. An additional floor of development has been added to mitigate this additional mass and the top floor has been set back from the street edge, maintaining a similar building mass hierarchy between the Bank of New South Wales and its neighbours.
43. The increased height of the car park mass will not impact Esk Street and due to the narrow nature of the street the car park will not be visible even from the northern footpath.
44. Through leasing strategy development the brief evolved to include an additional food destination. This revised programme freed space within the development to include two additional laneways.
45. The Food Central destination has been located upon the Tay Street façade, providing a gateway activity and active frontage to the Tay Street edge. This additional food court will connect through an internal north to south pedestrian laneway to Esk Street.
46. An additional internal street has been created behind Esk Street. Whilst covered with a skylight the floor will be surfaced and treated as an internal lane with a variety of shopfront typologies within the base build to continue to narrate the nature of Esk Street being a series of individualised unique tenancies.

## **PHASING**

47. The masterplan has been carefully considered to allow for a staged delivery and operation to the central city location. Key to the creation of destination is the Esk Street edge and the anchoring with key retailers. Allowing for a setback car park building from Esk Street along with tenancies facing onto the Esk Street frontage allows for construction of the Esk Street edge to be largely uncoupled from construction and development behind.
48. The Civic precinct and the HWR buildings cornering the development block can be constructed independently from the function of the central mall, department store and food precinct. As such the masterplan delivers a phasing strategy that can be delivered as a series of independent construction projects whilst releasing to market the key assets needed by the city to create the destinations heart, being the food precinct and retail offers.

49. It was important that the new development retained a sense of place – a connection to history. For the design team that was not only about creating a sense of vertical scale that was appropriate but also in grain along the length of each façade. To explore this the existing hierarchy and ordering of all four blocks were analysed reviewing existing and historic building massing, datum heights and boundaries. This was then redacted to a simplified grid system which was coded by architectural significance.
50. This simplified grid informed the structure of the proposed through façade primarily by driving variation along the façade edges in a rhythm consistent with the existing facade.

### **PARAPET DATUM HEIGHTS**

51. The development has been massed to respond to the district plan requirement to provide 10m built edge walls to Esk, Dee, Tay and Kelvin Streets. This datum has been arrived at to respect the established existing grain parapet line which hovers above and below this 10m height threshold.
52. As a massing strategy; the design responds to the District Plan design strategy of providing greater building mass and hierarchy to corner junctions. This is carried out through:
- a) locating a seven storey office building to the key location of the Newburgh Building;
  - b) framing the Bank of New South Wales with equally sized development respecting past history and ordering upon the site;
  - c) allowing for a six storey building on the Tay and Kelvin Streets corner framed by historic facades;
  - d) recessing the most visually dominant structure of the car parking building back from the Esk Street edge by approximately 20m and by 6m from the Tay Street edge.

### **STREETSCAPE – ESK STREET**

53. The district plan identifies a maximum height for a veranda as 3.5m. The rationale of developing a consistent philosophy for a veranda height is valid within the context of an individual building sitting within the context of a streetscape– to ensure the veranda gives consideration to its context and neighbouring development. The second rationale for the height limitation is to ensure protection of pedestrians from the weather.

54. The underlying design principle of the Invercargill Central development is to create a new city grain that is rich and layered with an informed texture of a variety of architectural styles and forms working cohesively. To achieve this the veranda is purposely varied in datum, material and section. This is a necessary reinforcement of the façade modulation.
55. Upon heritage stock the veranda canopy is formed of glass and steel. This is a clear distinction from the existing building and ensures that the façade is not obscured visually from below and the retained aesthetic can be viewed.
56. The height datum of the canopies to the Southland Times and Bank of New South Wales are fixed at datum heights which do not coincide with façade elements and details. As such the veranda height upon these buildings is higher than the prescribed 3.5m.
57. The second general area of non-compliance for canopy height is upon the Tay Street edge.
58. To the western Dee Street edge of Tay Street the veranda height is higher to coincide with design geometry informed by the Bank of New South Wales and the Courthouse formerly upon 4 Tay Street.
59. Along Tay Street the veranda height is typically higher. The buildings are given greater vertical proportions generally to the Tay Street edge to respond to the wider road section and wide pedestrian footpath, to enable the ground floor to maintain strong visibility from road traffic and to avoid billboard signage or tenant branded canopy edge signage, both of which are detrimental to the architecture and public realm.
60. As existing and in compliance with the district plan the veranda ratio of very wide canopy and low height creates a feeling of a cavern at the Tay Street edge. The limited footfall on Tay Street does not need such proportions and is not a desirable condition for the proposed redevelopment.
61. The material palette was derived from exploring material selections within the existing block—the traditional brick construction with rendered façade, capital details, canopy and veranda design. The response was to select materials with richness, textures and depth over a variety of scales which would echo the nature of what Esk and Tay Streets are in a contemporary manner.

**HERITAGE : DESIGN APPROACH**

62. The client's initial position was to assemble the development in the most effective way utilising heritage where it would positively benefit the overall scheme as opposed to starting from a position of selected retention of nominated stock (prior to considering the masterplan) and working a scheme around that.
63. From the project outset detailed consultation was carried out with Heritage New Zealand, Heritage Properties Limited acting as Heritage Architect and BMC Ltd. acting as Structural Engineers. Through this consultation a detailed history and condition of each building was established for the development site. The outcome of this process was recorded within the reports by Heritage Properties Limited and BMC Structural Engineers.

**CONSULTATION WITH NEW ZEALAND HERITAGE**

64. Throughout the design process direct dialogue has been held with New Zealand Heritage regarding how best to treat and respect the existing heritage stock on the site.
65. This was carried out through a series of meetings and design workshops both in Invercargill and at HNZ in Christchurch.
66. Through this process the design has evolved to include design input and feedback to result in the outcome submitted within the resource consent.
67. Following feedback from Heritage New Zealand within the notified resource consent, the design team reassessed the submission and interpretation of Heritage Merit.
68. Within our original dialogue with Heritage New Zealand the design team believed it would be an appropriate approach to maintain heritage aspects to all four facades. This approach resulted in the proposed retention of the Thompsons Building (18 Kelvin Street) and the Fairweather Building (58 Tay Street). Upon reflection, neither building carried significant Heritage building stock merit or cultural connection to the Southland people.
69. It became apparent to the Design Team and applicant that the Cambridge Arcade façade was of greater heritage and cultural merit to retain than other buildings upon the site. The Design Team reviewed with this in mind to ensure a retention of building stock and city legibility of retained place marks.

70. As such, a revised masterplan was developed to incorporate the Cambridge Arcade façade into the Esk Street façade treatment. This recognisable façade will need ground floor alteration to make it appropriate for a retail street frontage and to reinstate an ordering of the façade to the level 01 façade, which had been lost over time through retail refurbishments.
71. The primary change to the scale of the development is to reduce the overall wall length of the car park facade upon Tay Street.
72. Minor adjustments have occurred to the overall development programme increasing the density to the Civic Precinct by a floor. This does not change the overall bulk and street scene of the any of the street edges.
73. As the mass has been consolidated centrally the overall massing of the development has been reduced and thus mitigated the effects of the activity.

**(59-61 Esk Street) CAMBRIDGE ARCADE AND (40 Tay Street) CAMBRIDGE BUILDINGS**

74. The internal arcade environment of the Cambridge Building isn't suitable for the modern retail environment proposed for the centre.
75. That being said the Arcade does form a cultural connection (similar to the Southland Times). As such the masterplan intends to align the new entrance to retail to that of the Cambridge Arcade, creating a sense of memory and acknowledgement of the history of the place. In addition, following consultation with Heritage New Zealand, the Cambridge Building is proposed for facade retention.

**RESPONSE**

76. The proposed development is intended to read as a walkable and inviting development responding to the traditional ordering of the CBD. The architecture references not only what is in place at time of demolition, but also what has been demolished prior to respect the CBD grain.
77. The proposed development looks to selectively retain and adaptively re-use heritage stock. Esk Street retains the facade of number 31 as a counterpoint to the proposed HWR Building. Adjacent to this a facade language is established which reflects the ordering and grain of 31 Esk Street.

78. At the eastern end of the Esk Street block the Southland Times facade is retained and flanked by massing at the 10m datum. This has the effect of pronouncing the Southland Times, a standout building upon the Esk Street frontage. Having this converted to a major department store entrance has the additional benefit of securing the significance of the building through use and activity across two floors.
79. The Tay and Dee Street corner is held by the Bank of New South Wales and flanked by buildings reflective of the scale and strength of form which was intended with the initial construction of the Bank of New South Wales.
80. Overall each building retained has a strong purpose within the design narrative to reinforce granular development, reflective of historic building lots and thus pedestrian familiarity and memory.

#### **(1 DEE STREET) THE BANK OF NEW SOUTH WALES**

81. Prior to its demolition, adjacent to the Bank of New South Wales there was an equally scaled courthouse building. The pairing of these buildings was a complementary massing that strengthened the massing upon the corner of Dee and Tay Street.
82. The intention with the redevelopment surrounding the Bank of New South Wales is to acknowledge this lost heritage ordering and frame the Bank of New South Wales (or Troopers Memorial) with a complementary building that matches the datum of the now demolished courthouse.

#### **(67 ESK STREET) THE SOUTHLAND TIMES**

83. The Southland Times façade has been proposed to be retained. The building's three storey height and strong cultural ties to Southland offered an opportunity for reuse as a recognisable form.
84. It is not proposed to keep any of the Southland Times building behind the façade. New building will be constructed in place. The first floor level of the Southland Times will be for retail activity and the second floor of the Southland Times building will be for commercial activity – likely childcare.
85. As part of the initial studies of the site a retention of the Southland Times in the entirety of the 1908 build was considered. To achieve a rounded assessment of repurposing the Southland Times building not only was an assessment of the costs associated with restoring the building

- to a compliant 100% NBS rating required, an architectural redesign would be required too with an assessment of required building services works involved in upgrading to a modern compliant building.
86. From an architectural point of view the Southland Times has not been designed to suit the needs of modern retailing. Primarily this is due to the limited entrance into the Southland Times building through the existing entrance upon the western edge.
87. As such the façade would require adjustment to introduce further retail frontage, which requires significant modification to the ground floor entrance ways. I note that the original Southland Times entrance was centrally located suggesting the proposed adjustments to the façade are appropriate moves.
88. Moving into the development this existing entrance leads directly to a stair core, not the shop floor. This lack of direct connection is not a desirable outcome for a retailer but sits well with its original purpose of office functions to upper levels with a limited customer services area. However this lack of flexibility in floor plate arrangement has limited its desirability to the market since the departure of the Southland Times.
89. The floor plates internally are fragmented in three blocks leading back from the façade edge with limited spatial qualities of merit. Upon the ground floor this would result in limited function of retail past the first structural bay, if it was financially viable to do so. Alternative uses would need to be considered of secondary commercial nature. The floor plan of first and second floor accommodation for office or other commercial use would be fragmented and would not be suitable for the needs of a modern commercial office occupier.
90. To bring the Southland Times building back to a condition where it could be brought to market, the following scope was established, which includes the following high level requirements:
- a) a complete strip out of the existing fit out including walls, floor and ceiling finishes, services etc.;
  - b) an introduction of all seismic strengthening works as outlined in BMC's report;
  - c) cleaning and re-pointing of existing masonry externally;
  - d) upgrading of existing windows & doors;
  - e) making good of existing stairs and balustrades, remaining interior walls and doors;

- f) new floor, wall and ceiling finishes to suit tenantable spaces;
  - g) one tea point per floor;
  - h) replacing mechanical, electrical and fire services;
  - i) upgrading lift car finishes;
  - j) installing a security system.
91. Further to the constraints facing the building itself, retaining the 1908 build of the Southland Times significantly reduces planning flexibility for the balance of the development site. The building sits in board of site boundaries and has a significant depth. This compromises the potential locations of the proposed major anchor tenant floor plates or rational and effective car parking fields.
92. Keeping the 1908 build of the Southland Times would require a reversion to a planning strategy focussed on activating the external edges of development rather than knitting together a mixed use retail led development through internal networks and negate the potential of larger space activities being brought to the site.
93. After assessment including input from a structural and commercial lens, this was not identified as a viable alternative for refurbishment.

#### **SOUTHLAND TIMES FAÇADE RETENTION**

94. The planning of the development has been arranged to provide an entrance to the anchor retailer through the ground floor of Southland Times Façade. This in itself will achieve a long term appropriate outcome for the façade.
95. The mass of the façade sits appropriately with the mass of the two storey retailer proposed behind, thus allowing for long term upper level activation. As a destination the Southland Times façade will become a significant and recognisable place maker for the Invercargill Central development.
96. The primary move upon the Southland Times façade proposed is to open entrance ways within the ground floor through combining existing openings and returning these through the granite tile podium to the street front. These interventions will cause significant disturbance to the existing façade, however as an outcome will look appropriate and in keeping with the existing



- design for the building (prior to modifications) whereby the entrance was originally central on the façade.
97. Upon the upper floors the extent of works proposed is limited to painting the exposed brickwork. This will remedy issues with the existing brick work and pointing (ongoing maintenance).
  98. The new façade will be transformational for the building – a pristine façade with its heritage elements intact, suitable for future repurpose as a gateway to a shopping destination.
  99. We understand that painting the façade has acknowledged heritage concerns and in best practice of heritage retention the proposal should look to retain the exposed brickwork. However, our lens as the master planners of the entire development is to achieve a best for project outcome which puts back in place an in itself historic development.
  100. Our intention is to provide a jewel entrance for the development and the paintwork proposed offers the development this opportunity. A reversible treatment that can be stripped back if that is required in the future.
  101. The colours proposed for the façade are tones of white and neutrals from the Resene Colour Swatch library and implemented as follows:
    - a) exposed Brickworks and areas of replacement panel works (Eighth Tea);
    - b) lateral Banding (Truffle); and
    - c) cornices & Details (Napa).

**(31 ESK STREET) COXHEAD BUILDING**

102. The Coxhead Building sits directly adjacent to the proposed HWR Building (replacement for 33 Dee Street and 29 Esk Street).
103. The façade of the first floor of this building is proposed to be retained and restored.
104. It is considered that all balance of the building does not carry merit and will require demolition rather than considering a retention strategy. The internal layout of the development will align to datums externally to enable the façade to continue to be read both internally and externally as a recognisable building. The following key moves are proposed:
  - a) the façade will be redecorated with white and grey tone paint;

- b) new signage installed;
- c) architecturally designed facade lighting strategy.

#### **KEY BUILDINGS PROPOSED FOR DEMOLITION**

105. Within the development several key buildings were identified for demolition. In addition to the findings presented within the seismic structural assessment and that of heritage reviews the following comments are made.

#### **(33 DEE STREET) NEWBURGH BUILDING AND (29 ESK STREET) LEWIS & CO. BUILDING**

106. The Newburgh building is a recognisable building on the corner of Dee and Esk Streets. Paired with the Lewis & Co. Building it has formed a strong bookend to Esk Street. Retention of the building was not possible due to the structural condition exacerbated by the deterioration of materials.
107. In replacement a seven storey office building is proposed comprised of ground floor retail and food, a gateway stair to level one dining, car parking within the development, four levels of office accommodation and penthouse apartments on top.
108. The building reflects a pairing of structures through two contrasting façade languages bisected by the gateway staircase. However, the meeting of the two forms is presented on the northwest corner of the site, gesturing and inviting people into the development and onto Esk Street.
109. In demolishing these two buildings, care has been taken to replace them with a building of equitable recognition, place making and value to the Invercargill CBD.

#### **ADJUSTMENT TO CARPARK FACADE STRATEGY 'THE SOUTHERN LIGHTS'**

110. There is a desire to announce arrival to Invercargill Central. As Tay Street is a significant road corridor the desire has been to utilise this as a platform and backdrop to create an active artificially lit facade reflecting the 'Southern Lights' pattern. This dynamic facade will not be a backdrop (as originally proposed), but a beacon of arrival to Invercargill Central.

**SUBMISSIONS**

111. To respond to submitters commentary I have grouped commentary into groups of matters e.g. accessibility, bridge, shading, identifying the submitter number (taken from the schedule provided within the appendix of the Officer's Report).

**ACCESSIBILITY**

112. Relevant commentary in response to submitters:
- a) Submission 04 – Merric Apparel
  - b) Submission 15 – T Kahukura
  - c) Submission 18 – Hari-Priya Day / CCS
  - d) Submission 27 – Joy Pirrie
  - e) Submission 35 – CCS Disability Action
113. The development has been designed to not only be compliant with the Accessible Code 4121 but to also consider barrier free principles. Indeed, commercially it is in the client's interest to ensure that all areas are accessible to all and are seamless in connection.
114. This is carried out through analysing a variety of user journeys through the development. For example, upon arriving in the car park connection to the lift cores is provided through clear pedestrian paths and arrival directly into the centre of the development.
115. Within the development as a design outcome the Design Team has been able to achieve a consistent ground floor plan datum level on the ground floor at 6.300m with ramping required only on the primary Tay Street entrance. This is a surprisingly good and accessible outcome especially considering the not inconsequential cross fall across the 200m site.

**BRIDGE ACROSS KELVIN TO H&J'S DEPARTMENT STORE**

116. Relevant commentary in response to submitters:
- a) Submission 29 – H&J Smith Holdings Ltd
  - b) Submission 30 – Bob Simpson

c) Submission 24 – Vicky Henry

117. Regarding connection across H&J Smith a design study was carried out to connect up the uses of the Kelvin Hotel, H&J Smith and the HWCP development through a level 01 bridge connection across Kelvin Street. The connection involved a glass bridge connecting to the restaurant level of the Kelvin Hotel and the H&J Smith building.
118. Internally this could then connect across directly into the department store anchor tenant if acceptable commercially to all parties, or to level 02 at car park level.
119. I understand that this proposal sits with the ILT and H&J Smith for further consideration.

***SHADING TO SURROUNDING DEVELOPMENT***

120. Relevant commentary in response to submitters:

- a) Submission 33 – Downtown Invercargill Group
- b) Submission 37 – Christine Henderson

121. It has been noted that the buildings are of a scale that may cause shading over adjacent developments. I have carefully considered the massing of the development to follow the following principles:

- a) provide mass to the corners of the development – in line with the objectives of the district plan to accent block corners; and
- b) provide greater mass to the southern edges of the development.

122. In regards to the strategy of providing mass to the development at corners I note that this strategy is aligned to the district plan strategy, thus shading caused by perimeter buildings should be expected.

123. In regards to shading to the southern edge of the development this has purposely been carried out to maintain the two streetscapes to Esk Street and also to project shade onto public road state highway corridors. Tay Street is 40m in width and as such shading effects are not significant.

**CONTINUOUS VERANDAS**

124. The District Plan calls for consistent datum heights of veranda and canopy. I agree in principle with this as an approach if the District Plan is considering individual buildings, not the entirety of the city block. The development strategy is to break the block into a grain of buildings altered each 20m or 40m reflecting the original land parcels.
125. Whilst full veranda protection is provided our intention is to provide variation and interest and as such subtle variations to the height of the verandas to the perimeter have been proposed.

**PUBLIC ART INCLUSION**

- a) Submission 12 – Lisa Tou-McNaughton
126. The development does allow great potential for the incorporation of both temporary and permanent art installations. The interior of the development offers display opportunities, the piazza offers space for statue or permanent installation, the internal surfaces, including multi-media offers the ability to engage with other art formats. As noted within the Officer's Report (7.53.9) I support the provision of Interpretation Panels and displays on the history of the site. Engagement is needed within the design process and ongoing management to achieve these outcomes, as this is a key matter for public engagement with space and the development.

**RETAIL EMPHASIS**

- a) Submission 24 – Vicky Henry
- b) Submission 37 – Christine Henderson
127. A too heavy emphasis on retail has been raised as a concern by submitter 37. The development contains approximately 4,500sqm of specialty retail and 6,000sqm of anchor retailing. This is approximately 30% of the development proposal (and less than 50% coverage of the land block). The balance of activity is taken by other uses – food, civic functions, office accommodation, residential apartments, childcare as well as connections to the cinema and hotel. In my opinion this is a balanced multi-threaded development that brings retail activities but more importantly place, density and purpose to the central district.

**STREETSCAPE**

- a) Submission 37 – Christine Henderson

128. Significant time has been taken to understand the grain of the individual street frontages and develop responses that respect both the intent of the District Plan urban principles and the rhythm of the streetscape. Key elements of heritage have been retained and the development is respectful of the key heritage features of the streetscape.

### **SUSTAINABILITY**

129. One of the key design considerations is energy efficiency and the need to keep operating and running costs at an affordable level to provide a well-insulated high performing building that keeps heat losses in winter and heat gains in summer to a minimum.
130. We will specify high efficiency heat pump units with outdoor air economisers that make use of free cooling to provide tempered air supply to the mall. In addition, variable speed fans, controlled via CO2 sensors will reduce the outdoor air supply volume when occupancy levels are low, which will provide further energy savings.
131. Heat recovery ventilation units that recover heat from exhaust systems will also be used where suitable to ventilate areas such as the toilets and amenities.
132. Heating and cooling of the retail shop units will be via individual heat pumps linked to an energy efficient heat recovery VRF type system with the units fed and controlled from each shop unit's electrical panel. In addition, CO monitoring will be used to control the operation of the car park ventilation fans so that they only run when required.
133. A building management system (BMS) and controls shall be provided to monitor and control all mechanical systems within the building. The system can also be used to set up energy saving strategies and 'optimised start', to vary the plant start time each morning to match the required heating load and the reduce the number of hours the system runs.
134. Further energy efficient strategies are being explored as the Design Team advances into the further design stages.

### **OFFICER'S REPORT**

135. Within the report, specific commentary is made of the development to which I respond below.

**7.63 WEATHER PROTECTION**

136. Noting the Officer's concern regarding verandas in particular, I note that the canopy edge is broad at 3m depth, typical and appropriate to a central city location.
137. Greater depth will require edge support (columns or other), which reduces visibility to the shopfront – a symptomatic problem of the original condition.
138. The success of the Tay Street retailing will be from capturing in part traffic circulating (and not destination – through parking within the car park structure). Thus the shop fronts need to have bright, open, proportional shop fronts. Balanced with quality adequate pedestrian cover I believe the existing condition erred towards an overt pedestrian protection to the detriment of retailer visibility. The solution proposed errs more toward achieving better visual outcomes to the existing and thus learning lessons from the tenancy vacancies evident prior to commencing design.

**7.63 LANEWAY WEATHER PROTECTION**

139. I agree with the intent to provide and install a solid inward opening gate to negate the potential wind tunnelling through the Esk to Tay Street service laneway. It is proposed to install this upon Esk Street.

**7.63 ACCESSIBILITY**

140. I note the desire to create an accessible centre. This is a matter the applicant and its Design Team value within design for public spaces. However, being bound to improvement over and above the Building Act is not a matter that I would see as appropriate for a condition of consent.
141. I confirm that I have read and agree with the summary outcome to grant consent with narration below on specific conditions:
142. I recommend the following adjustments to the following proposed conditions:
- a) **3.g** : I am unclear about the retaining or reinstating clauses within the conditions in relation to 'decorative plasterwork' on the Southland Times. The submission does not propose the removal of any decorative plasterwork. It is the intent to retain all decorative plasterwork with the exception of the adjustments to the new central entrance. This clause is unnecessary and thus I recommend removal.

- b) **3.g** : The recommendation requires maintaining the unpainted brickwork to the Southland Times. I recommend removal of this clause to allow treatment of the façade to achieve the strongest overall architectural outcome as discussed within the evidence narration above. If the concern is in regards to restoration of brick work to former state in future then I suggest allowing test installation paint work be carried out with subsequent removal and assessment of deterioration of heritage.
  
- c) **26.** This recommendation requires a significant visibility splay of 2.5m width. We recommend reducing this splay width requirement to 2m and introduce improved tactile indicators to the pedestrian crossing points. Further evidence is addressed within Jay Baththana's report.

James Burgess

11 March 2019